

CY 2011 ODA Portfolio Review
REPORTED RESULTS OF EX-POST EVALUATED PROJECTS

	Project Title/Loan Number/Implementing Agency/Loan Closing Date	Results
1	Arterial Road Links Development Project, Phase III (PH-P188 /DPWH/2006) Overall Rating: B (Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increased employment opportunities (78% respondent agree) • Increased business chances (81% agree) • Reduction of traffic congestion in the target area (59% agree) • Increased family income (82% agree) • Increased transport of agriculture and industrial products (93% agree) • Increased access to the market of agriculture, wood and handicraft products (93% agree) • Increased access to the market, shops, schools, hospitals and public offices (90% agree) • Travel time savings (100% agree) • Travel cost reduction (64% agree but 17% disagree) • Traffic safety improved (60% agree but 12% disagree)
2	Fisheries Resource Management Project (PH-P197/DA/2007) Overall Rating: B (Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increased fish catch (65% indicated increased and about 50% indicated the increase was more than 4k/day) • Decreased incidence of illegal fishing activities (74% indicated decrease) • 74% of respondent indicated women's participation in community activities • 69% of respondents perceive promotion of economic activities • 60% of respondents perceive expansion of business chances • 70% of respondents answered that the family incomes increased • 75% of respondents perceive increase in live coral cover • 83% of respondents perceive high-value fish reappearance • Increased in the number of fish families • Decreased fish biomass
3	Provincial Cities Water Supply Project (Phases III, IV, V) (PH-P149,154,181/LWUA/2003,2004,2005) Overall Rating: B (Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improved sanitary conditions by safe water supply • Reduced cost and time for drawing water from nearby water resources
4	Tiwi Geothermal Power Plant complex rehabilitation Project (PH-P139/NPC/2006)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Promoted an effective use of geothermal energy, which is highly valued as a renewable domestic energy

	Project Title/Loan Number/Implementing Agency/Loan Closing Date	Results
	Overall Rating: D (Unsatisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lowered the cost of fuel equivalent to PhP 324 million (in case of gas-fired power generation) – PhP 2.256 billion (in case of oil-fired power generation) • Improved environmental condition thru installation of dilute hydrogen sulphide gas
5	Domestic Shipping Modernization Program III (PH-P151/DBP/2007) Overall Rating: A (Highly Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reduced distribution costs by 45% in the Western Nautical Highway within 5 years since its opening in 2003 and has become the main distribution means for agricultural products • Reduced travel time from Mindanao to Luzon from 36 developed maritime financing system and related PFIs hours to 24 hours
6	Philippine-Japan Friendship Highway Rehabilitation Project 1 and 2 (PH-P145/DPWH/2003) Overall Rating: A (Highly Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 80% of respondents replied that access to public facilities improved • Nearly all respondents stated increase in income by 10% to 20% • 72% of respondents mentioned increase in employment opportunities • 63% of respondents mentioned improvement in business opportunities • Smooth distribution of goods • Reduced transportation cost
7	Maritime Safety Improvement Project - 2 (PH-P208/DOTC/2001) Overall Rating: B (Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improved safety and efficiency of transportation • Improved accuracy of locating the position of vessels and safety • Increased volume of transportation including passengers and cargos • No adverse impact on the environment
8	Nationwide Air Navigation Facilities Modernization Project – Phase III (PH-P160/DOTC/2004) Overall Rating: C (Moderately Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increased by 10-20% (about 81,000-162,000 square nautical miles) the coverage of air-ground radio communication in the Philippine Flight Information Region • Improved communication sensitivity and direct communication between airport control centers and pilots • Improved safety and efficiency and increased air transport volume • Increased air transportation safety • Decreased frequency of weather-related cancellations
9	Leyte-Bohol interconnection Project (PH-P177/NPC/2004) Overall Rating: A (Highly Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contributed to a stable power supply • Increased by 2.4 times the number investments in Bohol provinces between 2003-2006 • Improved tourism promotion by the province and supported the tourism boom on the island

	Project Title/Loan Number/Implementing Agency/Loan Closing Date	Results
10	Luzon Grid Transmission Project associated with Private Power Project (PH-P178/NPC/2003) Overall Rating: A (Highly Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increased transmission capacity of the Luzon Grid • Increased transmission capacity throughout Metro Manila • Decreased the frequency and length of power outages • Improved stability of grid
11	Lower Agusan Development Project (PH-P153, PH-P180/DPWH/2006) Overall Rating: D (Unsatisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improved living standards • 77% of respondents increase their income • Majority of respondents perceived improvement on health and sanitation in the area • Increased annual farm income by more than 3x • More than half (57%) of the city respondents observed change in land use patterns and land prices • Increased development of housing project and establishment of businesses
12	Rehabilitation and Maintenance of Bridges Project (Phase IV) (PH-P207/DPWH/2007) Overall Rating: B (Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increased employment opportunities and/or income (80% of respondents). • Decreased number of traffic accidents (according to 51.4% of respondents). • Improved air quality (according to 56.5% of respondents). • Improved noise quality (according to 53.34% of respondents). • Contributed to the increase of agricultural production by improving the transport of agricultural products.
13	Arterial Road Links Development Project (Phase IV) (PH-P204/DPWH/2008) Overall Rating: B (Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reduced travel time • Increased shipping volume of goods (mainly crops) • Improved forms of access
14	Mak-ban Geothermal Power Plant Complex Rehabilitation Project (PH-P140/NPC/2006) Overall Rating: B (Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increased geothermal power generation at the Luzon Grid. • Reduced fuel cost equivalent to 720 million pesos (in case of gas-fired power generation) or 49.6 billion pesos (in case of oil-fired power generation)
15	Metro Manila Strategic Mass Rail Transit Development (I), (II), (III) (PH-P167, PH-P171, PH-P185/LRTA/2005) Overall Rating: C (Moderately Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Assuaged traffic jams in Metro Manila (according to 91% of respondents) • Decreased traffic congestion along roads parallel to LRT2 (according to 86% of respondents) • Enhanced access of work place (according to 24% of respondents) • Enhanced access to social services (according to 24% of respondents) • Enhanced access to markets/shops/trading

	Project Title/Loan Number/Implementing Agency/Loan Closing Date	Results
		<p>centers (according to 22% of respondents)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decreased travel time (according to 99% of respondents) • Reduced transportation cost (according to 97% of respondents) • Increased promotion of local economic activities (according to 83% of respondents) • Increased expansion of business chances (according to 72% of respondents) • Increased family income (according to 84% of respondents) • Improved air quality (according to 48% of respondents) • Improved noise quality (according to 37% of respondents)
16	<p>Agno and Allied Rivers Urgent Rehabilitation Project (PH-P155/DPWH/2005)</p> <p>Overall Rating: B (Satisfactory)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decreased concerns over flooding/inundation (according to 80% of respondents) • Improved livelihood and work due to reduction of the hindrance posed by flood/inundation risk (according to 87% of respondents) • Increased production volume (according to 56% of respondents) • Increased profits (according to 52% of respondents) • Improved community health condition (according to 86% of respondents) • Improved access to other areas (according to 89% of respondents)
17	<p>Local Government Units Support Credit Program (PH-P195/LBP/2006)</p> <p>Overall Rating: A (Highly Satisfactory)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improved governance including investment and management of funds (according to 42% of respondents) • Improved ability to plan and manage projects of LGUs (according to 36% of respondents) • Reduced household expenditures, i.e. water usage charges
18	<p>Northern Negros Geothermal Project (PH-P176/EDC/2006)</p> <p>Overall Rating: D (Unsatisfactory)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • limited/negligible impact on the stable supply of electricity
19	<p>Pinatubo Hazard Urgent Mitigation Project (PH-P209/DPWH/2001)</p> <p>Overall Rating: B (Satisfactory)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Some 8,700 residents in sand pocket areas, who had been evacuated from the volcanic mudflows, have returned to their land and are engaged in farming as before the disaster. • 7,000 cu m of volcanic mudflow sediments was controlled as planned. • Average daily traffic on the National Highway No. 3 increased from the estimated 6,000 vehicles in 1995 to 9,900 vehicles in 2004.

	Project Title/Loan Number/Implementing Agency/Loan Closing Date	Results
20	Metro Manila Interchange Construction Project (4) (PH-P186/DPWH/2005) Overall Rating: B (Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Average travel time for turning at the EDSA/Quezon Interchange (and the other interchanges) has reduced from 10 minutes at the time of appraisal to less than one minute. • A beneficiary survey showed that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ 90% experienced elimination of congestion and improvements in accessibility and mobility; ◦ 70% believed that the project resulted in more business and employment opportunities; ◦ 60% in reduction in transport costs; and ◦ 50% in contributions to local economic activities.
21	Industrial and Support Services Expansion Program (2) (PH-P198/DBP/2006) Overall Rating: A (Highly Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase in gross income (up by 18.4%), net profit (up by 31.1%), and total assets (up by 49.2%) of the end-users after receiving the loans.
22	Environmental Infrastructure Support Credit Program (2) (PH-P199/DBP/2006) Overall Rating: A (Highly Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Amount of water pollutants reduced: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ 470,100 kg/year (BOD) ◦ 940,000 kg/year (COD) ◦ 1,012,600 kg of TSS /year ◦ 6 kg of Cr⁶⁺/year • Amount of air pollutants reduced: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ 857 MT of Particulates/ year ◦ 1,286 MT of NO_x/ year ◦ 3,690 MT of SO₂/year ◦ 117 MT of CO/year • Amount of air pollutants reduced: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ 857 MT of Particulates/ year ◦ 1,286 MT of NO_x/ year ◦ 3,690 MT of SO₂/year ◦ 117 MT of CO/year • Amount of resources saved <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ 6,930 MWh energy/year ◦ 20,498,700 cu m water/year ◦ 21,200 MT raw materials/year • Amount of solid waste managed <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ 28,100 MT/year • Amount of hazardous waste/materials treated <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ 12,236 MT/year
23	Rural Road Network Development Project (II) (PH-P162/DPWH/2006) Overall Rating: B (Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Travel time reduced by 15 minutes or more, according to 200 respondents (53% of total respondents of the beneficiary survey). • Shipping volume of goods (mainly crops) increased, according to 225 (nearly 60% of total respondents of the beneficiary survey).
24	Philippine-Japan Friendship Highway (Mindanao Section)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 95% of respondents of the beneficiary survey reports that their travel time decreased

	Project Title/Loan Number/Implementing Agency/Loan Closing Date	Results
	Rehabilitation Project, Phase I and II (PH-P174 and PH-P206/DPWH/2006 and 2008) Overall Rating: B (Moderately Satisfactory)	significantly, with about 40% reporting a reduction of more than 50% travel time.
25	Pinatubo Hazard Urgent Mitigation Project, Phase II (PH-P166/DPWH/2006) Overall Rating: B (Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Period of inundation decreased by 63% from an average of 49.4 days (2000-2002) to an average of 18.1 days (2008-2010). • Average height of inundation decreased by 49% from an average of 89.7 cm (2000-2002) to an average of 45.8 cm (2008-2010). • Travel time from GSO Road to the Angeles-Porac road was reduced from 45 minutes in 1998 to 16 minutes.
26	South Mindanao Integrated Coastal Zone Management Project (PH-P194/DENR/2007) Overall Rating: B (Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Average survival rate of trees and mangroves is 83.7%, which is above the target of 80%. • Total asset base of the beneficiaries of the Livelihood Assistance Program increased from Php2.15 million to 3.652 million (170 % increase).
27	Mindanao Container Terminal Project (PH-P213/PHIVIDEDEC/2007) Overall Rating: A (Highly Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Total import volume increased by 54.9% from 14,172 TEU in 2008 to 21,946 TEU in 2009. • Total export volume increased by 51.8% from 17,165 TEU in 2008 to 26,063 TEU in 2009. • According to the statistics of the 10th administration region including the site of the project, the export drastically decreased in the region due to "global financial crisis" in 2009. Besides this "exceptional year", however, the export of the region shows sustainable increase. Even in 2009, decrease was mainly seen in industrial goods, light industrial goods and others, which are not the goods this region has its competitiveness for. On the other hand, food and mineral resources, which this region has its competitiveness for, rather increased in export volume.
28	Third Elementary Education Project (PH-4108/DepEd/2006) Overall Rating: A (Highly Satisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reduced the gap in academic performance in the National Achievement Tests (NAT), between the national average and that of the targeted provinces. • NAT average score in the targeted provinces (45.8 points) surpassed the national average (39.9 points) in 2005. • Number of students per classroom and the enrolment rate of junior high school in the targeted provinces have both improved. and the gap between the national average has declined as well.

	Project Title/Loan Number/Implementing Agency/Loan Closing Date	Results
29	Special Economic Zones Environmental Management Project (PH-P183/PEZA/2005) Overall Rating: D (Unsatisfactory)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The project has produced limited effects by the time of post evaluation, although some improvements are expected. • The project has made social contributions from the perspective of public health. • The project has reduced production cost through the stable supply of industrial water, the establishment of a communal sewage treatment facility, and the availability of recycled water. • The project resulted in an improvement of the management ability of PEZA • Project increased the productivity and employment of some firms utilizing the sewage treatment plants.